挑釁世界 - 對中心主義的反抗

PROVOKE - Opposing Centrism



東松照明 Shomei Tomatsu,啊!新宿 Oh! Shinjuku,1969,archival pigment print,91 x 127 cm © Shomei Tomatsu - INTERFACE, courtesy of Akio Nagasawa Gallery

2021年3月12日 - 6月20日

關渡美術館 一樓

展出藝術家:

挑釁 PROVOKE | 中平卓馬 Takuma Nakahira | 岡田隆彦 Takahiko Okada | 高梨豐 Yutaka Takanashi | 多木浩二 Koji Taki | 森山大道 Daido Moriyama

赤瀬川原平 Genpei Akasegawa 北井一夫 Kazuo Kitai 小清水漸 Susumu Koshimizu 李禹煥 Lee Ufan 西格瑪波爾克 Sigmar Polke 東松照明 Shomei Tomatsu 渡辺眸 Hitomi Watanabe

策展團隊:

王叡栩(關渡美術館)

長澤章生(Akio Nagasawa Gallery)

澤田陽子 (Osiris Co. Ltd)

黄亞紀、藍仲軒、黃子軒(Each Modern 亞紀畫廊)

主辦單位:關渡美術館

協辦單位:Each Modern 亞紀畫廊

特別感謝:也趣藝廊、陳雅青女士、Yumiko Chiba Associates、Galerie Nagel Draxler、月曜社、蕭永盛先生、木村一也先生、 森山大道攝影基金會、nitesha 二手舍、中平卓馬遺產、Collection Georg Polke、施俊兆先生、SCAI The Bathhouse、 Zen Foto Gallery

亞紀畫廊

PROVOKE 挑釁,日本戰後最著名的創作團體與同人誌,成立於 1968 年,由中平卓馬(Takuma Nakahira)與評論家多木浩二(Koji Taki)發起,成員包括岡田隆彥(Takahiko Okada)、高梨豐(Yutaka Takanashi)、與第二期加入的森山大道(Daido Moriyama)。他們以一種極度前衛的風格,審視了日本社會與政治的狀態。儘管只出版了三期,挑釁帶來的影響卻是深遠的,不僅是對於日本國內,也徹底改變了全世界的攝影走向。

如今,他們的影響仍可在新一代圖像製作者身上看見。尤其近來對兩位重要成員:中平卓馬和森山大道的研究,揭示了他們與世界前衛運動的複雜關係。挑釁不應只被視為攝影的突破,而更應被理解為與 1960 年代末至 1970 年代初,國際當代藝術在動盪的社會與藝術發展中,如何與其他地域、以及與中心主義對話與抗衡的重要運動。由此,本展分為三部分:「挑釁與行動主義」、「挑釁與物派」、「挑釁與資本寫實主義」,整理並對照這些在批判中建立的革新。

「挑釁世界 — 對中心主義的反抗」是首次以此脈絡對挑釁再次評價的研究性展覽。在此之前,國際間已有許多重要美術館展覽,對挑釁在攝影與日本藝術史上的貢獻提出了強烈肯定,包括「東京 1955-1970 年:新先鋒派」(MoMA,2013)、「為了該來到的新世界:日本藝術與攝影中的實驗 1968-1979 年」(休斯頓美術館和多館巡迴,2015-16)、「挑釁:在抗爭與表演之間 1960-1975 年的日本攝影」(芝加哥美術館和多館巡迴,2016-17)。

此次展覽是由關渡美術館、亞紀畫廊以及長澤章生、澤田陽子兩位策展人共同策劃,並得到森山大道攝影基金會、中平卓馬遺產的大力支持。同時要感謝也趣藝廊、陳雅青女士、Yumiko Chiba Associates、Galerie Nagel Draxler、月曜社、蕭永盛先生、木村一也先生、nitesha 二手舍、Collection Georg Polke、施俊兆先生、SCAI The Bathhouse、Zen Foto Gallery 慷慨的協助與指教。

挑釁與行動主義

挑釁的宣言為「為了思想的挑發式資料」,強調透過攝影和批判性寫作以挑戰思維、以顛覆政治思想和意識形態的既存面貌。雜誌《挑釁》共出版三期,每期僅印刷幾百本,他們的獨立性與時代的集體精神形成鮮明對比,可說是當時在東京經常可見、由匿名學生團體獨立出版的「抗爭手冊」的延續。無論是《挑釁》,或是各種激動的「抗爭手冊」,這些書都是在一種幻滅的背景下誕生-在已經延續抗爭與動盪十年,卻毫無結果之時。但是,與其他「抗爭手冊」的紀實風格不同,挑釁成員抓住了一種主觀的、零散的、爆炸性的方法,來捕捉正在經歷的世界。

1969 年,挑釁的靈魂人物中平卓馬決定結束這個團體的活動,隨後他發表了自己的攝影集《為了該有的語言》。1973 年,他出版重要評論集《為什麼是植物圖鑑》後,他燒盡了自己挑釁時期的底片與照片。然而幸運地,一些非常稀有的作品逃過了這個藝術悲劇:他為 1969 年巴黎青年雙年展所製作的照相凹版印刷—比起銀鹽相片,中平卓馬更偏好印刷獨特的屬性,包括與抗爭、海報相關聯的可複制性與可散佈性。

森山大道當時也專注於類似媒材: 絹印, 他的幾次個展都不是展出銀鹽相片, 卻是現場表演絹印印刷。從 1969 年到 1972 年, 他特別從報紙、廣告、或真實場景拍攝圖像, 但它們之間的區別是無法識別的: 《Scandalous》和《攝影啊再見》這兩個系列, 揭示了森山大道的實驗, 及其與普普藝術的關係。

而回頭看直接攝影,必須提及另外三位間接為挑釁做出貢獻的攝影師:東松照明(Shomei Tomatsu)、北井一夫(Kazuo Kitai)、渡辺眸(Hitomi Watanabe)。東松照明的主要作品包括拍攝美軍基地與日本社會美國化的紀錄,還有街頭抗議、地下文化圈的照片,這些作品在視覺上和意識上,都成為挑釁成員的導師。北井一夫則以記錄抗爭者的生活聞名,是最早具個人風格拍攝抗爭者與學生運動的攝影家。渡辺眸是這段歷史中最重要的女性攝影家,她深入學運內部所拍攝的作品,兼具情感性與記錄性。

即便《挑釁》解散,東松照明、森山大道、中平卓馬三人卻已成為攝影與前衛藝術發展的關鍵人物。《挑釁》的延續尤其出現在兩本雜誌,包括在 1970 年創刊、同樣僅有三期的《KEN》,以及成為文化核心刊物的《DESIGN》。

挑釁與物派

物派藝術家傾向呈現自然或工業材料,例如石頭、土壤、木材、紙張、布料、鋼板等,這些東西可以單獨使用,也可以互相結合,自然物體與物件不再被以物質思考,而是其本身具有重大意義與自主性。物派的主張與現有認知背道而馳,直接挑戰了西方現代藝術的價值觀。

1968年,關根伸夫(Nobuo Sekine)在同儕的協助下,為神戶須磨公園當代雕塑展建造了名為《位相一大地》的作品。這群藝術家都是來自多摩美術大學的學生,該大學也是當時學生運動最激烈的抗爭據點,學校封鎖,學生自主策劃各種演講,演講者包括中平卓馬。在這樣的時間背景下,關根伸夫與中平卓馬、李禹煥(Lee Ufan)相識,並開始進行有趣的對話。1971年,中平卓馬、李禹煥、

亞紀畫廊

小清水漸(Susumu Koshimizu)受邀参加巴黎青年雙年展,共同前往巴黎。同年,李禹煥發表了他的重要文集《相遇(出会いを求めて)》,中平卓馬受邀設計了這本書。 回到 1970 年,東京雙年展舉辦了一次歷史性展覽「人與物之間」-這個展覽幾乎為物派進行了定義,並讓物派藝術家們與法國支架/表面藝術運動(Supports/Surfaces)、義大利貧窮藝術(Arte Povera)、美國極簡主義(Minimalism)進行了對話。雙年展圖錄正是使用中平卓馬的作品作為封面:一片倒置視野的荒蕪工業用地。

挑釁與物派的思想核心,都圍繞著思考下列問題:如何透過結束表象來超越西方現代主義?如何審視戰後日本特有的感性?如何重新審視亞洲固有文本以關注事物的存在達到表現與創造的節制?就像當我們剖析李禹煥、小清水漸的作品時,會發現在亞洲經濟發展之下對生產力過剩的反省,以及當代藝術與社會中圖像的超載,是兩位藝術家創作持續碰觸的尖銳特徵。李禹煥設想著他的雕塑不僅是關於周圍環境,還包括對整個城市與空間的評斷;小清水漸藉由物件表面與身體空間嘗試理解現實世界—所有這些概念,都貫穿在中平卓馬 1970 年代兩組大型攝影裝置中:《循環》和《氾濫》。

另一方面,強調資本主義在日常生活物的痕跡、提出「資本主義現實主義論」的赤瀬川原平(Genpei Akasegawa),也與中平卓馬於 1971 年 7 月到 12 月,於《映畫批評》進行連載〈見赤馬〉。〈見赤馬〉的題名明顯來自革命作家薩文科夫(Boris Savinkov)的小說〈見黑馬〉(日本 1968 年由現代思潮社翻譯出版),赤瀬川原平與中平卓馬共同在其中傳達了對革命的崇拜與失望。最終,1972 年赤瀬川原平的《湯瑪森默示錄》開始以超藝術的方式,對這時代的前衛藝術做一個總結。

挑釁與資本寫實主義

1963 年,一群同樣對大眾媒體與資本主義的平庸抱持批判的藝術家,在德國柏林成立名為資本寫實主義(Capitalist Realism)的團體。資本寫實主義的起點價值是政治性的,這些藝術家以德國戰後社會為起點,面對柏林冷戰,他們多數人研究集體視覺文化,質疑圖像的含義,然後試圖挑戰美國普普藝術的主導地位。這些藝術家包括西格瑪·波爾克(Sigmar Polke)、格哈德·里希特(Gerhard Richter)、曼弗雷德·庫特納(Manfred Kuttner)、康拉德·呂格(Konrad Lueg)。

具有相似的背景與目的,挑釁和資本寫實主義雖然僅短暫存在,但自這兩個群體誕生出此世紀最重要的藝術家。**1960** 年代後期,波爾克和森山大道各自進行了介於繪畫與影像之間的實驗。波爾克對繪畫提出了有關在充滿影像的世界中,成為一名藝術家的意義問題,並探討了各種影像之間的關係。自 **1960** 年代初期,他便將不同來源的圖像並列,例如織物圖案、雜誌廣告、卡通和藝術史的標誌。波爾克的作品挑戰傳統的圖像層次,破解且面對這樣一個事實:當今世界上沒有圖像是神聖的,所有事物都可以在全世界即時複製與傳播,所有文字、圖像都將經過個人解釋,而視覺信息卻又通常是不可信任的。

在他的整個創作生涯中,波爾克都將報紙作為創作靈感來源,提供了繪畫的形式和主題,還啟發波爾克一種模仿網點的繪畫風格。 1990年代中期,波爾克甚至受到報紙印刷錯誤的啟發,著手發展了名為《Druckfehler》(即「印刷錯誤」)的系列,探討大眾感知的脆弱性,以及人類試圖傳達單種意涵的內在問題。

1969年,森山大道在《朝日相機》雜誌上連載了《事故》一這系列的作品在2016年重新編輯並更名為《Scandalous》一是由報紙、電視、電影、海報、名人照片中複製破裂圖像的實驗,以批評大眾媒體的混亂與偷窺。《Scandalous》透過絲網印刷,使圖像在三次曝光與顯影中於上下文本之間轉移,宣告了圖像的混沌性與開放性。在比較波爾克和森山大道時,我們發現每種創作之間都存在斷裂的形式和悲觀的空虛,以及背後對經典的統一與和諧一即文化崇高的殘餘的重新省思。

亞紀畫廊



中平卓馬 Takuma Nakahira,*La nuit*,1969,攝影凹版 photogravure, 57.5 x 85 cm © Gen Nakahira 施俊兆先生收藏 Collection of Leo Shih



渡辺眸 Hitomi Watanabe,東大全共闘 The University of Tokyo Zenkyoto 1968-1969,1968-1969,銀鹽照片 gelatin silver print,25.4 x 20.3 cm © Hitomi Watanabe, courtesy of Zen Foto Gallery



森山大道 Daido Moriyama,*挑釁* Provoke 2,1968/2018, 絹印畫布 silk screen on canvas,110 x 165 cm © Daido Moriyama, courtesy of Each Modern



北井一夫 Kazuo Kitai,抵抗(彩色)Resistance(color),1965/2011, pigment print ,50 x 60 cm © Kazuo Kitai, courtesy of Yumiko Chiba Associates

亞紀畫廊



森山大道 Daido Moriyama,*攝影啊再見* Farewell Photography,1972/2021,

銀鹽相紙 gelatin silver print,50 x 60 cm © Daido Moriyama, courtesy of Akio Nagasawa Gallery



西格瑪波爾克 Sigmar Polke,*無題 Untitled*,1970 – 1980, photograph on AGFA C90 paper, 21 x 29.5 cm © Collection Georg Polke





(左)中平卓馬 Takuma Nakahira,*氾濫* Overflow,1974 /2018,攝影裝置 photography installation,140 x 580 cm © Gen Nakahira, courtesy of Each Modern and Osiris

(右)中平卓馬,*氾濫* Overflow 局部

PROVOKE

Opposing Centrism



Shomei Tomatsu, Oh! Shinjuku, 1969, archival pigment print, 91 x 127 cm © Shomei Tomatsu - INTERFACE, courtesy of Akio Nagasawa Gallery

12 March - 27 June 2021 Kuandu Museum of Fine Arts, Taipei (First Floor)

Exhibiting Artists:

PROVOKE | Takuma Nakahira Takahiko Okada Yutaka Takanashi Koji Taki Daido Moriyama Genpei Akasegawa Kazuo Kitai Susumu Koshimizu Lee Ufan Sigmar Polke Shomei Tomatsu Hitomi Watanabe

Curatorial Team:

Wang Rui-Xu (Kuandu Museum of Fine Arts)
Akio Nagasawa (Akio Nagasawa Gallery)
Yoko Sawada (Osiris Co. Ltd)
Huang Yaji, Lan ChungHsuan, Huang ZiHsuan (Each Modern)

Organizer: Kuandu Museum of Fine Arts

Co-organizer: Each Modern

Special thanks to Aki Gallery, Joce Chen, Yumiko Chiba Associates, Galerie Nagel Draxler, Getsuyosha, Hsiao YongSeng, Kazuya Kimura, Daido Moriyama Photo Foundation, nitesha, Estate of Takuma Nakahira, Collection Georg Polke, Leo Shih, SCAI The Bathhouse, Zen Foto Gallery

亞紀畫廊

PROVOKE was founded in Tokyo in 1968 by Takuma Nakahira and Koji Taki. Members included Takahiko Okada, Yutaka Takanashi, and Daido Moriyama who joined the second issue. The group and magazine examined Japan's socio-political situation with a radically inventive style. Although only three issues were published, PROVOKE's impact would prove to be profound, revolutionizing photography inside and outside Japan.

Today, the influence of their work can still be seen in new generations of image-makers. Recent research of two key members, Takuma Nakahira and Daido Moriyama, reveal their complicated context with world avant-garde movements. Rather than a breakthrough of photography, PROVOKE should be considered as an important movement in dialogue with parallel international contemporary art happenings during the late 1960s to early 1970s. Therefore, the exhibition is composed by three sections - PROVOKE and Activism, PROVOKE and Mono-Ha, PROVOKE and Capitalist Realism – to clarify and to compare the innovations formed in the criticism.

"PROVOKE – Opposing Centrism" This is the first research-based exhibition revaluates PROVOKE which takes this perspective, following many important museum shows valuating PROVOKE's contributions in photography and Japanese art history, including "Tokyo 1955–1970: A New Avant-Garde" (MoMA, 2013), "For a New World to Come: Experiments in Japanese Art and Photography, 1968–1979" (The Museum of Fine Arts Houston and tour, 2015-16), "Provoke: Between Protest and Performance, Photography in Japan 1960–1975" (The Art Institute of Chicago and tour, 2016-17).

This exhibition is curated by Each Modern and two curators Akio Nagasawa and Yoko Sawada. It is fully supported by Daido Moriyama Photo Foundation and Estate of Takuma Nakahira with Special thanks to Aki Gallery, Joce Chen, Yumiko Chiba Associates, Galerie Nagel Draxler, Getsuyosha, Hsiao YongSeng, Kazuya Kimura, nitesha, Collection Georg Polke, Leo Shih, SCAI The Bathhouse, Zen Foto Gallery.

PROVOKE and Activism

With its subtitle "provocative materials for thought", PROVOKE advocated independent thinking, featuring photography and critical writing that sought to challenge its readers to reconsider the existing images of a politically and ideologically revolutionary time. Totaling three issues and printed in small runs of a few hundred copies each, PROVOKE stood in contrast to the collective spirit of the times; as alternatively evidenced in proliferation of "protest books" distributed in Tokyo made by anonymous student committees. These books existed in a context of disillusionment: at the end of a decade of fruitless protests and upheavals. However, unlike the documentary style of other protest books, PROVOKE members seized a subjective, fragmented, and explosive method to capture experiencing the world.

In 1969, Takuma Nakahira ended PROVOKE activities and published his own photobook "For the Language to Come". In 1973 after releasing his critical collective "Why an Illustrated Botanical Dictionary?", he set fire to his negatives and photographs taken during PROVOKE. Yet there still remains some very rare works: the photogravure he made for 1969 Paris Biennale – rather than gelatin silver prints, Nakahira preferred photogravure to refer the reproducibility and distributivity of posters and processions.

Daido Moriyama also focused on silkscreen at that time. He seldom produced gelatin silver prints but produced silkscreen on site as performance. From 1969 to 1972, he particularly photographed images from newspapers, advertisements, or real scenes; distinction between them was unrecognizable. Two bodies of work, "Scandalous" and "Farewell Photography", uncovered his experiments and his relation to Pop Art.

Returning to direct photographs, there are three other photographers who indirectly contributed to PROVOKE: Shomei Tomatsu, Kazuo Kitai, and Hitomi Watanabe. Tomatsu's major projects include photographing the U.S. occupation and subsequent Americanization of Japan, and pictures of both violence on the streets and the roaring underground of Tokyo. These visually and consciously mentored the members of PROVOKE. Kazuo Kitai, well-known for recording the life of protesters, is the earliest individual artist who published the protesters images in a very personal style. Watanabe is the most important female photographer at the time. She thoroughly photographed the student protests in both emotional and documentary way.

While PROVOKE eventually disbanded, Shomei Tomatsu, Daido Moriyama, and Takuma Nakahira still played a key role in the developments of photography and avant-garde art. The discussion extended to two magazines in particular: KEN, first published in 1970 which lasted for only three issues, and DESIGN, a publication which became the core of the culture.

EACH MODERN 亞紀畫廊

PROVOKE and Mono-Ha

Mono-ha artists tended to present natural and industrial materials such as stone, soil, wood, paper, cotton, steel plates, and paraffin—things (mono)—on their own or in combination with one another. Natural matter and objects were considered not as material, but in and of themselves significant and autonomous, deviating from existing cognitions and rebelling against the values of the Western modern art.

In 1968, assisted by his friends, Nobuo Sekine constructed an earthwork titled "Phase—Mother Earth" for the first Suma Rikyu Park Contemporary Sculpture Exhibition in Kobe. These artists were all from Tama Art University, a location of student protest and lock downed. During lock down, Takuma Nakahira went to school for student activities, and later both Sekine and Nakahira met Lee Ufan. From this encounter began their interesting dialogues. In 1971, Nakahira, Lee, and Susumu Koshimizu were invited to show at Paris Biennale and spent times together. Later the year, Lee published his important writing collective "The Search for Encounter" and Nakahira designed the book. In 1970, Tokyo Biennale made a historical exhibition "Between Man and Matter" and framed Mono-ha with the commonalities of Supports/Surfaces in France, Arte Povera in Italy, and Minimalism in the United States. The Biennale catalogue used Nakahira's work as cover: a desolating industrial land with inverting view.

Discussions revolved around questions of how to transcend Western Modernism by ending representation, a sentiment endemic to postwar Japan, a re-examination of indigenous culture as a means to bring attention to the physicality of things, and the limits of creativity: these were equivalence of PROVOKE and Mono-ha. In fact, the essential economy of gesture - a critique of hyper-productivity and the 'imagery overload' in contemporary art and society - is a constant feature throughout the careers of Lee Ufan and Susumu Koshimizu. The context in which Lee envisages his work is not limited to its immediate surroundings but encompasses the whole city. His sculptures are as much about the invisible as the visible, about the rebellion of making. Meanwhile, Koshimizu also tried to understand the real world through the surface of the object and the space of the body. All these concepts were clearly seen in Nakahira's two large photo installation from the 1970s: "Circulation" and "Overflow".

On the other hand, Genpei Akasegawa, an artist who emphasized the trace of Capitalism in everyday life and put forward "Capitalist Realism" published "The Red-Horse Looked at it" as a serial with Takuma Nakahira in the magazine Film Critic from July to December, 1971. The title of the series is apparently inspired by the revolutionary Russian writer Boris Savinkov's novel The Black Horse(translated by Gendaishichosha in Japan, 1968). Both Akasegawa and Nakahira conveyed their admiration and disappointment to the revolution. Eventually, Akasegawa concluded the avant-garde art of this era by his "Hyperart Thomasson" created in 1972.

PROVOKE and Capitalist Realism

In 1963, Capitalist Realism, a group of artists similarly interested in mass media, Capitalism, and the banal, attempting to challenge the dominating influence of American pop art, was formed in Berlin, Germany. Its cultural value was political, facing Cold War Berlin, using Germany's post-war society as its starting point. Most of them investigated the terrain of collective visual culture and questioned the meaning of images. Artists associated with capitalist realism included Sigmar Polke, Gerhard Richter, Manfred Kuttner and Konrad Lueg.

Sharing similar background and challenges, PROVOKE and Capital Realism both had short existences but from these two groups, important artists emerged. During late 1960s, Sigmar Polke and Daido Moriyama were independently developing parallel experimentations. Polke's paintings ask questions about the meaning of being an artist in a world bombarded with images, and explore the relationship between different kinds of imagery. Since the early 1960s he has juxtaposed images from very different sources, such as fabric patterns, magazine advertising, cartoons and the icons of art history. These works challenge the traditional hierarchy of imagery, and confront the fact that in today's world no image is sacred: everything is subject to instant reproduction and dissemination all over the world, all words and images are subject to personal interpretation and visual information is often unreliable.

Throughout his career Polke has used newspapers as a source of inspiration in his work. They have provided subject matter for paintings and drawings, and have also inspired a technique of imitating the 'dotted', half-tone process of commercial printing. In the mid-1990s Polke began to work on a new series called Druckfehler, or 'Printing Mistakes', inspired by printing errors found in newspapers. This series explores the fragile nature of perception and the inherent problems of trying to convey fixed meanings.

亞紀畫廊

From January to December 1969, Moriyama serialized "Accident" at Asahi Camera magazine. "Accident", reselected and renamed as "Scandalous", is an experiment of reproducing cracked images from newspapers, TV, movies, posters and celebrity photos to criticize the chaos and voyeurism of mass media. As silkscreens, the imagery shifts through context and meaning for a third time, proclaiming chaotic hybridity and the open-endedness of images.

In comparing Polke and Moriyama we find within each something between fractured forms and a pessimistic sense of emptiness, as well as a longing for unity and harmony that is classical and also a remnant of the cultural sublime.



Daido Moriyama, Farewell Photography, 1972/2021, gelatin silver print, 50 x 60 cm © Daido Moriyama, courtesy of Akio Nagasawa Gallery



Sigmar Polke, *Untitled*, 1970 - 1980, photograph on AGFA C90 paper, 21 x 29.5 cm © Collection Georg Polke





(L) Takuma Nakahira, Overflow, 1974/2018, photography installation, 40 x 580 cm © Gen Nakahira, courtesy of Each Modern and Osiris (R) Overflow detail

EACH MODERN 亞紀畫廊



Takuma Nakahira, La nuit, 1969, photogravure, 57.5 x 85 cm © Gen Nakahira, Collection of Leo Shih



Hitomi Watanabe, The University of Tokyo Zenkyoto 1968-1969, 1968-1969, gelatin silver print, 25.4×20.3 cm © Hitomi Watanabe, courtesy of Zen Foto Gallery



Daido Moriyama, Provoke 2, 1968/2018, silk screen on canvas, 110 x 165 cm © Daido Moriyama, courtesy of Each Modern



Kazuo Kitai, Resistance(color), 1965/2011, pigment print, 50 x 60 cm © Kazuo Kitai, courtesy of Yumiko Chiba Associates